

# Collection Service Agreement for Residential and Commercial Garbage, Recyclable Material and Organic Waste - Procurement Results

---



**PRESENTATION TO:**

Town of Windsor  
Town Council  
April 19<sup>th</sup>, 2017



# Proposals Received/Current State

---

## ❑ A total of five proposals were received, from the following companies:

- C&S Waste Solutions, Inc. (C&S)
- GreenWaste Recovery, Inc. (GW)
- Sonoma County Resource Recovery, LLC. (SCRR)
- USA Waste of California, Inc aka Waste Management (USA)
- Windsor Refuse and Recycling, LLC. (WR&R)

## ❑ Current state of solid waste:

- Current collection service needs improvements to vehicles, containers and facilities (all of which are outdated and need replacement/significant upgrades)
- 10 year contract term maximum is expiring, therefore a new 10-year contract is being assigned
- Almost all customers will experience moderate to significant rate increases (discussed later in presentation)



# New Collection Service Agreement (CSA)

## *Details*

All Single-Family Dwelling (SFD), Multi-Family Dwellings (MFD), and Commercial Customers will receive a minimum of weekly collection of Garbage, Recyclable Material and Organic Waste (includes collection of green waste, all food waste, and soiled paper fibers), and recycling or disposal of dry-cell batteries

### **SFD Collection Service**

- Holiday Tree curbside collection and drop-off location (two weeks per year)
- Used Motor Oil and Used Oil Filter curbside collection, recycling and/or lawful disposal
- Recyclable Material Overages Collection of recyclable material that does not fit in the Service Recipient's cart or bin

### **Additional Services Provided to the Town**

- Collection at public areas and parks, the Windsor Unified School District (WUSD) facilities, and the Windsor Fire Protection District (WFD) facilities
- Street Sweeping Service
- Town Enforcement Clean-up Service (illegal dumping)
- Solid waste services at Town-sponsored events
- Contractor-provided Education and Outreach Program (including part-time Diversion Coordinator position)
- Use of new collection vehicles
- Use of new collection carts and bins



# Added Benefit to the Town

## *Improved Services in new CSA*

---

- ❑ Diversion requirement and associated penalties
- ❑ Compliance with recent State laws
- ❑ Increased reporting requirements (diversion tonnage, contamination, etc.)
- ❑ Contamination protocols
- ❑ Improved education and outreach to customers including on-the-ground technical assistance, website, school program, and other services
- ❑ Increased commitment to sustainability
- ❑ Revised rate structure to include recyclable material and organic waste processing



# Service Recipient Rate Increase

---

- ❑ Flow control requirements of disposal and residual material
- ❑ Tip fee increases at Central Disposal Landfill/Transfer System
- ❑ Tip fee increases for green waste/organic waste processing
- ❑ No currently available in-County processing for recyclable materials or organic waste
- ❑ Historically low rates
- ❑ Weak end-market prices for recyclable material and organic waste
- ❑ State mandates change the solid waste management system (AB 341, AB 1826 and AB 1594)

# Proposal Evaluation

---

- ❑ Five members of the Town's evaluation team analyzed each proposal and attributed a score with a total possible of 600 (100 for each category)

## Evaluation RFP Criteria

Qualifications

Financial Ability

Technical Approach

Sustainability Program

Education and Outreach Programs

Service Recipient Rates

# Evaluation Score Results

RFP Criteria	C&S	GW	SCRR	USA	WR&R	WR&R*** 4/14 "Clarification"
Qualifications	391	401	434*	396	313	313
Financial Ability	395	385	380	440*	325	325
Technical Approach	388	409	438*	388	392	392
Sustainability Programs	362	440	448*	343	317	317
Education and Outreach Programs	419	381	441*	354	376	376
Service Recipient Rates	420	485*	360	415	320	438
<b>Total</b>	<b>2375**</b>	<b>2500**</b>	<b>2501**</b>	<b>2336**</b>	<b>2042**</b>	<b>2160**</b>

\* Indicates the top score per criteria category.

\*\* Cumulative score rounded to the next digit.

\*\*\* On 4/14/17, WR&R submitted a letter requesting clarification of rates submitted after proposal summaries became public on 4/13/17.



# C&S Waste Solutions, Inc. (C&S)

## *Highlights*

---

- ❑ Well developed education and outreach plan
- ❑ Capacity to tailor communication and education/outreach to local community
- ❑ Requires local transfer operations – purchase and construction of new facility
- ❑ Generally higher rates for SFD, and lower rates for MFD and Commercial customers
- ❑ Potentially insufficient collection vehicles/routes
- ❑ Made significant exceptions to meeting diversion requirements of CSA



# GreenWaste Recovery, Inc. (GW)

## *Highlights*

---

- ❑ Fully committed to meeting diversion requirements and sound approach for meeting
- ❑ MRF Processing
- ❑ Well developed education and outreach plan
- ❑ Generally lower rates for SFD, MFD and Commercial customers
- ❑ Minimal knowledge of local solid waste industry
- ❑ Requires local direct transfer operations – purchase and construction of new facility

# Sonoma County Resource Recovery, LLC. (SCRR)

## *Highlights*

---

- ❑ Fully committed to meeting diversion requirements and sound approach for meeting
- ❑ Well developed education and outreach plan
- ❑ Company has never operated as SCRR (conglomerate of three entities)
- ❑ Requires direct local transfer operations – purchase and construction of new facility
- ❑ Generally higher rates for SFD, MFD and Commercial customers

# USA Waste of California, Inc. (USA)

## *Highlights*

---

- ❑ High use of technology in operations and performance tracking
- ❑ High financial strength and ability
- ❑ Education and outreach plan that lacks in detail and specificity
- ❑ Corporate structure may provide minimal capacity to tailor communication and outreach  
Does not need local transfer facility
- ❑ Made significant exceptions to meeting diversion requirements of CSA

# Windsor Refuse and Recycling, LLC. (WR&R)

## *Highlights*

---

- ❑ Currently provides services, which makes for less needed transition activities
- ❑ Residential and commercial rates fourth highest (excluding 4/14/2017 clarification)
- ❑ Proposed processing facility for recyclable may not meet Town's needs
- ❑ Joint venture with local C&D hauler/processor to transfer recyclables
- ❑ Announced sale to Recology after proposal was submitted creates many unknown technical elements

# Rate Comparison -

## *Single-Family Dwelling Rate*

Container Size	Current Rates	Proposed Rates					
		GW*	SCRR*	C&S	USA	WR&R	WR&R** 4/14 "Clarification"
20 gal	\$11.11	\$19.00	\$17.88	\$35.98	\$27.72	\$40.50	\$20.44
32 gal	\$17.20	\$23.00	\$25.82	\$39.54	\$30.37	\$43.06	\$23.00
64 gal	\$29.31	\$36.00	\$40.72	\$46.66	\$37.72	\$52.66	\$40.74
96 gal	\$47.52	\$49.00	\$55.62	\$57.34	\$44.93	\$66.04	\$66.04

- Rates above include a total cost for garbage service, 96-gallon recycling service, 96-gallon organics service, and the Franchise Fee.
- Rates do not include the optional services.

\*GW and SCRR rates represent the negotiated rates as of 4/5/17, which include the increase tip rate for disposal and organics processing as of April 1, 2017.

\*\*\* On 4/14/17, WR&R submitted a letter requesting clarification of rates submitted after proposal summaries became public on 4/13/17.



# Rate Comparison -

## *Multi-Family Dwelling - Garbage*

Container Size (1x week collection)	Current Rates	Proposed Rates				
		GW*	SCRR*	C&S	USA	WR&R
32 gal	\$17.20	\$40.82	\$59.10	\$28.84	\$37.38	\$52.57
64 gal	\$29.30	\$61.98	\$69.23	\$49.14	\$64.77	\$70.81
96 gal	\$47.52	\$84.44	\$94.55	\$79.69	\$96.34	\$88.13
1 CY	N/A	\$210.49	N/A	N/A	\$270.21	\$338.18
1.5 CY	\$231.99	\$282.80	\$283.06	\$290.38	\$308.68	\$380.50
2 CY	\$276.13	\$348.38	\$330.24	\$345.63	\$384.23	\$452.90
3 CY	\$381.72	\$478.21	\$471.77	\$477.80	\$538.90	\$626.08
4 CY	\$436.95	\$534.09	\$566.13	\$546.93	\$672.99	\$770.97
6 CY	\$561.52	\$631.61	\$707.66	\$702.85	\$915.32	\$920.98
10 CY Per Pull	N/A	\$250.00	\$350.00	\$250.19	\$150.35	\$370.05
20 CY Per Pull	\$225.64	\$250.00	\$400.00	\$250.19	\$157.87	\$370.05
30 CY Per Pull	\$254.55	\$290.00	\$450.00	\$250.19	\$165.76	\$417.46
40 CY Per Pull	\$254.55	\$290.00	\$500.00	\$250.19	\$174.05	\$417.46
Compactor	\$253.41	\$325.00	\$600.00	\$250.19	\$191.45	\$417.46

\*GW and SCRR rates represent the negotiated rates, which include the increase tip rate for disposal and organics processing as of April 1, 2017.



# Rate Comparison -

## *Multi-Family Dwelling - Recycling*

Container Size (1/week collection)	Current Rates	Proposed Rates				
		GW	SCRR **	C&S	USA	WR&R
32 gal	\$0.00	\$6.70	N/A	No Charge	\$21.00	\$49.08
64 gal	\$0.00	\$9.53	N/A	No Charge	\$35.22	\$63.83
96 gal	\$0.00	\$12.66	\$55.62	No Charge	\$52.09	\$77.67
1 CY	\$0.00	\$33.28	N/A	No Charge	\$104.09	\$313.77
1.5 CY	\$0.00	\$43.11	\$99.32	No Charge	\$111.20	\$343.88
2 CY	\$0.00	\$51.56	\$148.98	No Charge	\$135.55	\$404.07
3 CY	\$0.00	\$68.17	\$248.30	No Charge	\$185.91	\$552.83
4 CY	\$0.00	\$69.50	\$347.62	No Charge	\$226.70	\$673.30
6 CY	\$0.00	\$83.00	\$446.94	No Charge	\$296.26	\$774.48
10 CY Per Pull	\$0.00	\$225.00	\$350.00	No Charge	\$175.70	\$370.05
20 CY Per Pull	\$0.00	\$225.00	\$400.00	No Charge	\$184.49	\$370.05
30 CY Per Pull	\$0.00	\$225.00	\$450.00	No Charge	\$193.71	\$417.46
40 CY Per Pull	\$0.00	\$225.00	\$500.00	No Charge	\$203.39	\$417.46
Compactor	\$0.00	\$225.00	\$600.00	No Charge	\$223.73	\$417.46

\*\* SCRR rates include a 3-year phase in based on 50% of shown rate in 1<sup>st</sup> year, 75% of shown rate in 2<sup>nd</sup> year and 100% of rate shown in 3<sup>rd</sup> year – this applies to MFD Recycling, MFD Organics, Commercial Recycling and Commercial Organics



# Rate Comparison -

## *Multi-Family Dwelling - Organics*

Container Size (1/week collection)	Current Rates	Proposed Rates				
		GW	SCRR **	C&S	USA	WR&R
32 gal	\$12.90	\$24.68	N/A	No Charge	\$31.19	\$49.08
64 gal	\$21.98	\$39.09	\$81.44	No Charge	\$53.14	\$63.83
96 gal	\$35.64	\$54.16	N/A	No Charge	\$78.81	\$77.67
1 CY	\$0.00	\$130.49	N/A	No Charge	\$130.55	\$313.77
1.5 CY	\$173.99	\$179.39	\$198.64	No Charge	\$147.52	\$343.88
2 CY	\$207.10	\$224.97	\$248.30	No Charge	\$183.02	\$404.07
3 CY	\$286.29	\$315.46	\$347.62	No Charge	\$255.80	\$552.83
4 CY	\$327.71	\$369.27	\$446.94	No Charge	\$318.29	\$673.30
6 CY	\$421.14	\$502.90	N/A	No Charge	\$604.81	Not Accepted
10 CY Per Pull	N/A	\$225.00	\$350.00	No Charge	\$175.70	Not Accepted
20 CY Per Pull	N/A	\$225.00	\$400.00	No Charge	\$184.49	Not Accepted
30 CY Per Pull	N/A	\$275.00	\$450.00	No Charge	\$193.71	Not Accepted
40 CY Per Pull	N/A	\$275.00	\$500.00	No Charge	\$203.39	Not Accepted
Compactor	N/A	\$325.00	\$600.00	No Charge	\$213.56	Not Accepted

\*\* SCRR rates include a 3-year phase in based on 50% of shown rate in 1<sup>st</sup> year, 75% of shown rate in 2<sup>nd</sup> year and 100% of rate shown in 3<sup>rd</sup> year – this applies to MFD Recycling, MFD Organics, Commercial Recycling and Commercial Organics





# Rate Comparison -

## Commercial - Garbage

Container Size (1/week collection)	Current Rates	Proposed Rates				
		GW	SCRR**	C&S	USA	WR&R
32 gal	\$32.05	\$40.82	\$69.52	\$35.91	\$37.38	\$52.57
64 gal	\$39.17	\$61.98	\$81.44	\$56.08	\$64.77	\$70.81
96 gal	\$43.74	\$84.44	\$111.24	\$86.82	\$96.34	\$88.13
1 CY	N/A	\$210.49	N/A	N/A	\$270.21	\$338.18
1.5 CY	\$231.99	\$282.80	\$297.96	\$301.59	\$308.68	\$380.50
2 CY	\$276.13	\$348.38	\$347.62	\$358.97	\$384.23	\$452.90
3 CY	\$381.72	\$478.21	\$496.60	\$496.24	\$538.90	\$626.08
4 CY	\$436.95	\$534.09	\$595.92	\$568.04	\$672.99	\$770.97
6 CY	\$561.52	\$631.61	\$744.91	\$729.98	\$915.32	\$920.98
10 CY Per Pull	\$225.64	\$250.00	\$350.00	\$250.19	\$150.35	\$370.05
20 CY Per Pull	\$254.55	\$250.00	\$400.00	\$250.19	\$157.87	\$370.05
30 CY Per Pull	\$254.55	\$290.00	\$450.00	\$250.19	\$165.76	\$417.46
40 CY Per Pull	\$253.41	\$290.00	\$500.00	\$250.19	\$174.05	\$417.46
Compactor	\$225.64	\$325.00	\$600.00	\$250.19	\$191.45	\$417.46

\*\*SCRR's "full rate" includes a 3-year phase in based on 50% of shown rate in 1<sup>st</sup> year, 75% of shown rate in 2<sup>nd</sup> year and 100% of rate shown in 3<sup>rd</sup> year.



# Rate Comparison -

## Commercial - Recycling

Container Size (1/week collection)	Current Rates	Proposed Rates				
		GW	SCRR**	C&S	SCRR	WR&R
32 gal	\$0.00	\$6.70	N/A	No Charge	N/A	\$49.08
64 gal	\$0.00	\$9.53	N/A	No Charge	N/A	\$63.83
96 gal	\$0.00	\$12.66	\$55.62	No Charge	\$55.62	\$77.67
1 CY	N/A	\$33.28	N/A	No Charge	N/A	\$313.77
1.5 CY	\$0.00	\$43.11	\$99.32	No Charge	\$99.32	\$343.88
2 CY	\$0.00	\$51.56	\$148.98	No Charge	\$148.98	\$404.07
3 CY	\$0.00	\$68.17	\$248.30	No Charge	\$248.30	\$552.83
4 CY	\$0.00	\$69.50	\$347.62	No Charge	\$347.62	\$673.30
6 CY	\$0.00	\$83.00	\$446.94	No Charge	\$446.94	\$774.48

\*\* SCRR rates include a 3-year phase in based on 50% of shown rate in 1<sup>st</sup> year, 75% of shown rate in 2<sup>nd</sup> year and 100% of rate shown in 3<sup>rd</sup> year – this applies to MFD Recycling, MFD Organics, Commercial Recycling and Commercial Organics



# Rate Comparison - *Commercial - Organics*

Container Size (1/week collection)	Current Rates	Proposed Rates				
		GW	SCRR**	C&S	USA	WR&R
32 gal	\$24.04	\$24.68	N/A	<b>\$17.36</b>	\$31.19	\$49.08
64 gal	\$29.38	\$39.09	\$81.44	<b>\$27.11</b>	\$53.14	\$63.83
96 gal	\$32.81	\$54.16	N/A	<b>\$41.96</b>	\$78.81	\$77.67
1 CY	N/A	<b>\$130.49</b>	N/A	N/A	\$130.55	\$313.77
1.5 CY	\$173.99	\$179.39	\$198.64	<b>\$145.77</b>	\$147.52	\$343.88
2 CY	\$207.10	\$224.97	\$248.30	<b>\$173.50</b>	\$183.02	\$404.07
3 CY	\$286.29	\$315.46	\$347.62	<b>\$239.85</b>	\$255.80	\$552.83
4 CY	\$327.71	\$369.27	\$446.94	<b>\$274.55</b>	\$318.29	\$673.30

\*\* SCRR rates include a 3-year phase in based on 50% of shown rate in 1<sup>st</sup> year, 75% of shown rate in 2<sup>nd</sup> year and 100% of rate shown in 3<sup>rd</sup> year – this applies to MFD Recycling, MFD Organics, Commercial Recycling and Commercial Organics



# Optional Services -

## *Effect on Proposed Rates*

Options and Programs That Could Increase/Reduce Proposed Rates					
Optional Programs	GW	SCRR	WM	C&S	WR&R
On-Call Bulky-Waste Collection (each SFD account/month)	\$0.00	\$0.56	\$0.26	\$0.41	\$0.59
Community Clean-up Collection (each SFD account/month)	\$0.00	\$0.16	\$0.26	\$0.59	\$0.20
Deletion of Street Sweeping Costs	(\$1.45)	(\$0.84)	(\$0.43)	(\$0.57)	(\$0.20)

# Final Negotiations –

## *Proposed Rates & Percentage Increase*

Service Recipient	Percentage of Services	Container Size	Current Rates	Final Proposed Rates			
				GW*	GW % Increase	SCRR*	SCRR % Increase
Single-Family	11.1%	20 gal	\$11.11	\$19.00	71.0%	\$17.88	60.9%
Single-Family	47.8%	32 gal	\$17.20	\$23.00	33.7%	\$25.82	50.1%
Single-Family	35.4%	64 gal	\$29.31	\$36.00	22.8%	\$40.72	38.9%
Single-Family	5.7%	96 gal	\$47.52	\$49.00	3.1%	\$55.62	17.0%
Single-Family Overall Percentage Increase					27.1%		41.6%

Service Recipient	Container Size	Current Rates	Final Proposed Rates			
			GW	GW % Increase	SCRR**	SCRR % Increase
Multi-Family / Commercial Garbage	varies	varies	varies	23.3%	varies	35.5%
Multi-Family / Commercial Recycling	varies	varies	varies	n/a	varies	n/a
Multi-Family / Commercial Organics	varies	varies	varies	29.2%	varies	51.1%

GW and SCRR rates represent the negotiated rates as of 4/5/17, which include the increase tip rate for disposal and organics processing as of April 1, 2017.

\* Rates above include total cost for garbage, 96-gallon recycling and organics, and the Franchise Fee.

\*\* SCRR rates include a 3-year phase in based on 50% of shown rate in 1<sup>st</sup> year, 75% of shown rate in 2<sup>nd</sup> year and 100% of rate shown in 3<sup>rd</sup> year – this applies to MFD Recycling, MFD Organics, Commercial Recycling and Commercial Organics.



# RFP Results and Recommendation

## *GreenWaste Recovery, Inc.*

---

- ❑ Best combination of SFD, MFD and Commercial customer rates
- ❑ New spilt-body collection vehicles (2 stops/house)
- ❑ Use of high diversion /high tech MRF
- ❑ Expanded list of acceptable recyclables
- ❑ Well developed outreach and public education, diversion, and transition plans

# Collection Service Agreement

## *Additional Items for Discussion With GW*

---

### Impact on Customer Rates:

- Senior Discount / Low-Income Discount
- Annual Pre-Payment Discount
- Savings from Economies of Scale –  
Potential additional contracts with  
other public agencies within Sonoma  
County

# Council Action

---

- Adopt a resolution awarding a Collection Service Agreement (“CSA”) to GreenWaste Recovery, Inc.; and
- Authorize the Town Manager to execute and implement the CSA; and
- Approve maximum service rates, effective October 1, 2017; and/or
- Provide direction to staff