

Collection Service Agreement for Residential and Commercial Garbage, Recyclable Material and Organic Waste: Procurement Results



PRESENTATION TO:

Town of Windsor
Town Council

May 17, 2017



Current State of Solid Waste and Improvements to the System

- 10-year contract term maximum is expiring, therefore a new 10-year contract is being assigned
- Improvements to facilities, vehicles and containers (all of which are outdated and need replacement/significant upgrades)
- Improved education and outreach to customers including on-the-ground technical assistance, website, school program, and other services
- Diversion requirement and associated penalties
 - Compliance with recent State laws
 - Increased reporting requirements (diversion tonnage, contamination, etc.)
- Contamination protocols
- Increased commitment to sustainability
- Revised rate structure to include recyclable material and organic waste processing
- Almost all customers will experience moderate to significant rate increases (discussed later in presentation)

New Collection Service Agreement (CSA)

Details

All Single-Family Dwelling (SFD), Multi-Family Dwellings (MFD), and Commercial customers will receive a minimum of weekly collection of Garbage, Recyclable Material and Organic Waste (includes collection of green waste, all food waste, and soiled paper fibers), and recycling or disposal of dry-cell batteries

SFD Collection Service

- Holiday Tree curbside collection and drop-off location (two weeks per year)
- Used Motor Oil and Used Oil Filter curbside collection, recycling and/or lawful disposal
- Recyclable Material Overages Collection of recyclable material that does not fit in the Service Recipient's cart or bin

Summary of Additional Services Provided to the Town

- Collection at public areas and parks, the Windsor Unified School District (WUSD) facilities, and the Windsor Fire Protection District (WFD) facilities
- Street Sweeping Service
- Town Enforcement Clean-up Service (illegal dumping)
- Solid waste services at Town-sponsored events
- Contractor-provided Education and Outreach Program (including part-time Diversion Coordinator position)
- Use of new (or refurbished) collection vehicles
- Use of new (or refurbished) collection carts and bins

Proposals Evaluation

- A total of five proposals were received from:
 - C&S Waste Solutions, Inc. (C&S)
 - GreenWaste Recovery, Inc. (GW)
 - Sonoma County Resource Recovery, LLC. (SCRR)
 - USA Waste of California, Inc. aka Waste Management (USA)
 - Windsor Refuse and Recycling, LLC. (WR&R)
- Five members of the Town's evaluation team analyzed each proposal according to the following criteria.

Evaluation RFP Criteria
Qualifications (100 pts)
Financial Ability (100 pts)
Technical Approach (100 pts)
Sustainability Program (100 pts)
Education and Outreach Programs (100 pts)
Service Recipient Rates (100 pts)

Original Evaluation Score Results

Original Proposers' Score Per Evaluation Criteria Section					
RFP Criteria	SCRR	GW	C&S	USA	WR&R
Qualifications	434	401	391	396	313
Financial Ability	380	385	395	440	325
Technical Approach	438	409	388	388	392
Sustainability Programs	448	440	362	343	317
Education and Outreach Programs	441	381	419	354	376
Service Recipient Rates	360	485	420	415	320
Total	2,501	2,500	2,375	2,336	2,042
Ranking	1 (tie)	1 (tie)	3	4	5

- All total scores have been rounded to the nearest whole number
- Evaluation team cumulative score results from February 21, 2017

Adjusted Evaluation Score Results

Proposers' Score Per Evaluation Criteria Section – Adjusted for Clarified and Negotiated Rates					
RFP Criteria	SCRR	GW	C&S	USA	WR&R
Qualifications	434	401	391	396	313
Financial Ability	380	385	395	440	325
Technical Approach	438	409	388	388	392
Sustainability Programs	448	440	362	343	317
Education and Outreach Programs	441	381	419	354	376
Service Recipient Rates	409	499	423	387	422
Total	2,550	2,515	2,378	2,308	2,145
Adjusted Ranking	1	2	3	4	5

- All total scores have been rounded to the nearest whole number
- Adjusted evaluation score results after “negotiated” rates with SCRR and GW on April 5, 2017
- Adjusted evaluation score results after “clarification” rates from C&S and WR&R on April 27, 2017
- Adjusted evaluation score results consistent with original ranking from the evaluation teams cumulative scores on February 21, 2017

Sonoma County Resource Recovery, LLC. (SCRR)

Highlights

- ❑ Company has never operated as SCRR (conglomerate of 3 entities in Bay Area)
- ❑ Requires SFD split cart recycling collection: fiber and containers in separate compartments
- ❑ Offered to operate split truck collection – 2 stops/house
- ❑ Fully committed to meeting diversion requirements and provided sound approach
- ❑ Well-developed education and outreach plan
- ❑ Will process recyclables at their San Rafael MRF
 - ❑ Requires local direct transfer operations – purchase and construction of a new transfer facility

GreenWaste Recovery, Inc. (GW)

Highlights

- ❑ Previously held Petaluma contract; operates in Bay Area
- ❑ Will operate split truck collection – 2 stops/house
- ❑ Fully committed to meeting diversion requirements and included sound approach
 - Proposed to exceed Town’s diversion requirements
- ❑ Well-developed education and outreach plan
- ❑ Will process recyclables at their San Jose MRF
 - ❑ Requires local direct transfer operations – purchase and construction of new transfer facility in Petaluma

C&S Waste Solutions, Inc. (C&S)

Highlights

- ❑ Smaller company operating in Northern California and Nevada
- ❑ Proposed the fewest number of vehicles and routes
- ❑ Ultimately agreed to meet Town's diversion requirements, but did not provide required diversion tonnage estimates
- ❑ Well-developed education and outreach plan
- ❑ Will operate split truck collection – 2 stops/house
- ❑ Will process recyclables at their Ukiah MRF
 - Requires local transfer operations for recyclables – purchase and construction of new facility in Windsor

USA Waste of California, Inc. (USA)

Highlights

- ❑ Corporate structure may provide minimal capacity to tailor communication and outreach to community
- ❑ High use of technology in operations, performance tracking and financial ability
- ❑ Will use traditional 3 cart system – 3 stops/house
- ❑ Made significant exceptions to meeting diversion requirements of CSA
- ❑ Education and outreach plan lacks in detail and specificity
- ❑ Will process recyclables at their Sacramento MRF
 - Does not need to build local transfer facility

Windsor Refuse and Recycling, LLC. (WR&R)

Highlights

- ❑ Announced sale to Recology after proposal was submitted creates many unknown technical elements
- ❑ Joint venture: The Ratto Group and Industrial Carting
- ❑ Currently provides services, which makes for less needed transition activities
- ❑ Use of a third-party contractor for design of education and outreach plan
- ❑ Proposed processing facility in Stockton for source separated recyclables may not meet Town's needs
 - Industrial Carting to transfer recyclables
- ❑ Proposes to process dry commercial mixed waste at the new MRF at the Central Landfill

Service Recipient Rate Increase

- ❑ Historically low rates
- ❑ Flow control requirements of disposal and residual material
- ❑ Tip fee increases at Central Disposal Landfill/Transfer System
- ❑ Tip fee increases for green waste/organic waste processing
- ❑ Not currently available in-County processing for recyclable materials or organic waste
- ❑ Weak end-market prices for recyclable material and organic waste
- ❑ State mandates change the solid waste management system (AB 341, AB 1826 and AB 1594)

Service Recipient Rate Options

- ❑ Customers have the ability to “mix-and-match” the best combination of garbage, recyclables, and organic carts or bins that best match the customer’s unique needs.
 - Single Family Dwelling (“SFD”) customer may have a combination of 20, 32, 64, or 96 gallon carts for garbage, recyclables, or organics, and each cart size and material type has a different price point. Accordingly, it is possible to have 64 combinations of SFD rates.
 - Commercial and Multi-Family Dwelling (“MFD”) customers may have garbage, recyclables, or organics provided in 32, 64 or 96 gallon cart sizes, and 1, 1.5, 2, 3, 4, 6 cubic yard bins and 10, 20, 30 and 40 cubic yard debris boxes, and up to 6 days per week collection frequency.
- ❑ There is no single Proposer with the lowest rate in all available service options
- ❑ For purposes of evaluating each proposal, each Proposer’s service recipient rates were applied in a matrix against the available information on customer service levels (i.e., cart/bin size, material collected, frequency of collection).

Rate Comparison -

Single-Family Dwelling Rate

Container Size	Current Rates	SFD Proposed Rates						
		Negotiated (1)		Clarified (2)		As Submitted		
		GW	SCRR	C&S	WR&R	USA	WR&R	C&S
20 gal	\$11.11	\$19.00	\$17.88	\$18.63	\$20.44	\$27.72	\$40.50	\$35.98
32 gal	\$17.20	\$23.00	\$25.82	\$28.84	\$23.00	\$30.37	\$43.06	\$39.54
64 gal	\$29.31	\$36.00	\$40.72	\$49.14	\$40.74	\$37.42	\$52.66	\$46.66
96 gal	\$47.52	\$49.00	\$55.62	\$79.69	\$66.04	\$44.93	\$66.04	\$57.34

(1) GW and SCRR as provided in this table represent the negotiated rates as of April 5, 2017, which include the **increased** tip rate for disposal and organics processing as of April 1, 2017.

(2) C&S and WR&R clarified the *intended* rates after meeting with the Town on April 27, 2017.

- Compared rates above include a total cost for garbage service, 96-gallon recycling service, 96-gallon organics service, and the Franchise Fee.
- All rates above do not include the optional services for SFD On-Call Large Item Collection, SFD Community Clean-up, or HHW Collection (Options 1 through 3). The adjustment to be made to these rates, if the Town wishes to do so, will only affect the collection element (except GW, which is offering free Option 1 and 2).

Rate Comparison -

Multi-Family Dwelling - Garbage

Container Size (1x week collection)	Current Rates	Proposed Rates				
		GW*	SCRR*	C&S	USA	WR&R
32 gal	\$17.20	\$40.82	\$59.10	\$28.84	\$37.38	\$52.57
64 gal	\$29.30	\$61.98	\$69.23	\$49.14	\$64.77	\$70.81
96 gal	\$47.52	\$84.44	\$94.55	\$79.69	\$96.34	\$88.13
1 CY	N/A	\$210.49	N/A	N/A	\$270.21	\$338.18
1.5 CY	\$231.99	\$282.80	\$283.06	\$290.38	\$308.68	\$380.50
2 CY	\$276.13	\$348.38	\$330.24	\$345.63	\$384.23	\$452.90
3 CY	\$381.72	\$478.21	\$471.77	\$477.80	\$538.90	\$626.08
4 CY	\$436.95	\$534.09	\$566.13	\$546.93	\$672.99	\$770.97
6 CY	\$561.52	\$631.61	\$707.66	\$702.85	\$915.32	\$920.98
10 CY Per Pull	N/A	\$250.00	\$350.00	\$250.19	\$150.35	\$370.05
20 CY Per Pull	\$225.64	\$250.00	\$400.00	\$250.19	\$157.87	\$370.05
30 CY Per Pull	\$254.55	\$290.00	\$450.00	\$250.19	\$165.76	\$417.46
40 CY Per Pull	\$254.55	\$290.00	\$500.00	\$250.19	\$174.05	\$417.46
Compactor	\$253.41	\$325.00	\$600.00	\$250.19	\$191.45	\$417.46

*GW and SCRR rates represent the negotiated rates as of April 5, 2017, which include the increase tip rate for disposal and organics processing as of April 1, 2017.

Rate Comparison -

Multi-Family Dwelling - Recycling

Container Size (1/week collection)	Current Rates	Proposed Rates					
		GW	SCRR **	C&S	USA	WR&R Source Separated	WR&R Dry Mixed Waste Processing
32 gal	\$0.00	\$6.70	N/A	No Charge	\$21.00	No Charge	\$49.08
64 gal	\$0.00	\$9.53	N/A	No Charge	\$35.22	No Charge	\$63.83
96 gal	\$0.00	\$12.66	\$55.62	No Charge	\$52.09	No Charge	\$77.67
1 CY	\$0.00	\$33.28	N/A	No Charge	\$104.09	No Charge	\$313.77
1.5 CY	\$0.00	\$43.11	\$99.32	No Charge	\$111.20	No Charge	\$343.88
2 CY	\$0.00	\$51.56	\$148.98	No Charge	\$135.55	No Charge	\$404.07
3 CY	\$0.00	\$68.17	\$248.30	No Charge	\$185.91	No Charge	\$552.83
4 CY	\$0.00	\$69.50	\$347.62	No Charge	\$226.70	No Charge	\$673.30
6 CY	\$0.00	\$83.00	\$446.94	No Charge	\$296.26	No Charge	\$774.48
10 CY Per Pull	\$0.00	\$225.00	\$350.00	No Charge	\$175.70	No Charge	\$370.05
20 CY Per Pull	\$0.00	\$225.00	\$400.00	No Charge	\$184.49	No Charge	\$370.05
30 CY Per Pull	\$0.00	\$225.00	\$450.00	No Charge	\$193.71	No Charge	\$417.46
40 CY Per Pull	\$0.00	\$225.00	\$500.00	No Charge	\$203.39	No Charge	\$417.46
Compactor	\$0.00	\$225.00	\$600.00	No Charge	\$223.73	No Charge	\$417.46

** SCRR rates include a 3-year phase in based on 50% of shown rate in 1st year, 75% of shown rate in 2nd year and 100% of rate shown in 3rd year – this applies to MFD Recycling, MFD Organics, Commercial Recycling and Commercial Organics

Rate Comparison -

Multi-Family Dwelling - Organics

Container Size (1/week collection)	Current Rates	Proposed Rates				
		GW	SCRR **	C&S	USA	WR&R
32 gal	\$12.90	\$24.68	N/A	No Charge	\$31.19	\$49.08
64 gal	\$21.98	\$39.09	\$81.44	No Charge	\$53.14	\$63.83
96 gal	\$35.64	\$54.16	N/A	No Charge	\$78.81	\$77.67
1 CY	\$0.00	\$130.49	N/A	No Charge	\$130.55	\$313.77
1.5 CY	\$173.99	\$179.39	\$198.64	No Charge	\$147.52	\$343.88
2 CY	\$207.10	\$224.97	\$248.30	No Charge	\$183.02	\$404.07
3 CY	\$286.29	\$315.46	\$347.62	No Charge	\$255.80	\$552.83
4 CY	\$327.71	\$369.27	\$446.94	No Charge	\$318.29	\$673.30
6 CY	\$421.14	\$502.90	N/A	No Charge	\$604.81	Not Accepted
10 CY Per Pull	N/A	\$225.00	\$350.00	No Charge	\$175.70	Not Accepted
20 CY Per Pull	N/A	\$225.00	\$400.00	No Charge	\$184.49	Not Accepted
30 CY Per Pull	N/A	\$275.00	\$450.00	No Charge	\$193.71	Not Accepted
40 CY Per Pull	N/A	\$275.00	\$500.00	No Charge	\$203.39	Not Accepted
Compactor	N/A	\$325.00	\$600.00	No Charge	\$213.56	Not Accepted

** SCRR rates include a 3-year phase in based on 50% of shown rate in 1st year, 75% of shown rate in 2nd year and 100% of rate shown in 3rd year – this applies to MFD Recycling, MFD Organics, Commercial Recycling and Commercial Organics

Rate Comparison -

Commercial - Garbage

Container Size (1/week collection)	Current Rates	Proposed Rates				
		GW	SCRR	C&S	USA	WR&R
32 gal	\$32.05	\$40.82	\$69.52	\$35.91	\$37.38	\$52.57
64 gal	\$39.17	\$61.98	\$81.44	\$56.08	\$64.77	\$70.81
96 gal	\$43.74	\$84.44	\$111.24	\$86.82	\$96.34	\$88.13
1 CY	N/A	\$210.49	N/A	N/A	\$270.21	\$338.18
1.5 CY	\$231.99	\$282.80	\$297.96	\$301.59	\$308.68	\$380.50
2 CY	\$276.13	\$348.38	\$347.62	\$358.97	\$384.23	\$452.90
3 CY	\$381.72	\$478.21	\$496.60	\$496.24	\$538.90	\$626.08
4 CY	\$436.95	\$534.09	\$595.92	\$568.04	\$672.99	\$770.97
6 CY	\$561.52	\$631.61	\$744.91	\$729.98	\$915.32	\$920.98
10 CY Per Pull	\$225.64	\$250.00	\$350.00	\$250.19	\$150.35	\$370.05
20 CY Per Pull	\$254.55	\$250.00	\$400.00	\$250.19	\$157.87	\$370.05
30 CY Per Pull	\$254.55	\$290.00	\$450.00	\$250.19	\$165.76	\$417.46
40 CY Per Pull	\$253.41	\$290.00	\$500.00	\$250.19	\$174.05	\$417.46
Compactor	\$225.64	\$325.00	\$600.00	\$250.19	\$191.45	\$417.46

Rate Comparison -

Commercial - Recycling

Container Size (1/week collection)	Current Rates	Proposed Rates					
		GW	SCRR**	C&S	USA	WR&R Source Separated	WR&R Dry Mixed Waste Processing
32 gal	\$0.00	\$6.70	N/A	No Charge	\$21.00	No Charge	\$49.08
64 gal	\$0.00	\$9.53	N/A	No Charge	\$35.22	No Charge	\$63.83
96 gal	\$0.00	\$12.66	\$55.62	No Charge	\$52.09	No Charge	\$77.67
1 CY	N/A	\$33.28	N/A	No Charge	\$104.09	No Charge	\$313.77
1.5 CY	\$0.00	\$43.11	\$99.32	No Charge	\$111.20	No Charge	\$343.88
2 CY	\$0.00	\$51.56	\$148.98	No Charge	\$135.55	No Charge	\$404.07
3 CY	\$0.00	\$68.17	\$248.30	No Charge	\$185.91	No Charge	\$552.83
4 CY	\$0.00	\$69.50	\$347.62	No Charge	\$226.70	No Charge	\$673.30
6 CY	\$0.00	\$83.00	\$446.94	No Charge	\$296.26	No Charge	\$774.48

** SCRR rates include a 3-year phase in based on 50% of shown rate in 1st year, 75% of shown rate in 2nd year and 100% of rate shown in 3rd year – this applies to MFD Recycling, MFD Organics, Commercial Recycling and Commercial Organics

Rate Comparison - *Commercial - Organics*

Container Size (1/week collection)	Current Rates	Proposed Rates				
		GW	SCRR**	C&S	USA	WR&R
32 gal	\$24.04	\$24.68	N/A	\$17.36	\$31.19	\$49.08
64 gal	\$29.38	\$39.09	\$81.44	\$27.11	\$53.14	\$63.83
96 gal	\$32.81	\$54.16	N/A	\$41.96	\$78.81	\$77.67
1 CY	N/A	\$130.49	N/A	N/A	\$130.55	\$313.77
1.5 CY	\$173.99	\$179.39	\$198.64	\$145.77	\$147.52	\$343.88
2 CY	\$207.10	\$224.97	\$248.30	\$173.50	\$183.02	\$404.07
3 CY	\$286.29	\$315.46	\$347.62	\$239.85	\$255.80	\$552.83
4 CY	\$327.71	\$369.27	\$446.94	\$274.55	\$318.29	\$673.30

** SCRR rates include a 3-year phase in based on 50% of shown rate in 1st year, 75% of shown rate in 2nd year and 100% of rate shown in 3rd year – this applies to MFD Recycling, MFD Organics, Commercial Recycling and Commercial Organics

Final Negotiations –

Proposed Rates & Percentage Increase

Service Recipient	Percentage of Services	Container Size	Current Rates	Final Proposed Rates			
				GW	GW % Increase	SCRR	SCRR % Increase
Single-Family	11.1%	20 gal	\$11.11	\$19.00	71.0%	\$17.88	60.9%
Single-Family	47.8%	32 gal	\$17.20	\$23.00	33.7%	\$25.82	50.1%
Single-Family	35.4%	64 gal	\$29.31	\$36.00	22.8%	\$40.72	38.9%
Single-Family	5.7%	96 gal	\$47.52	\$49.00	3.1%	\$55.62	17.0%
Single-Family Overall Percentage Increase (total revenue increase)					27.1%		41.6%**

Service Recipient	Container Size	Current Rates	Final Proposed Rates			
			GW	GW % Increase	SCRR**	SCRR % Increase
Multi-Family / Commercial Garbage	varies	varies	varies	23.3%	varies	35.5%
Multi-Family / Commercial Recycling	varies	varies	varies	n/a	varies	n/a
Multi-Family / Commercial Organics	varies	varies	varies	29.2%	varies	51.1%

GW and SCRR rates represent the negotiated rates as of April 5, 2017, which include the increase tip rate for disposal and organics processing as of April 1, 2017.

* Rates above include total cost for garbage, any size recycling and organics, and the franchise fee.

** SCRR percentage increase of total revenue is reflective of the full phase in (at Year 3, and doesn't consider the Year 1 and Year 2 phase in).



RFP Results and Recommendation

GreenWaste Recovery, Inc.

- ❑ Qualified and experienced in providing similar services in the Bay Area
- ❑ Best combination of SFD, MFD and Commercial customer rates
- ❑ New split-body collection vehicles (2 stops/house)
- ❑ Use of state-of-the-art MRF, and sound commitment to diversion
 - Expansive list of acceptable recyclables
- ❑ Well-developed education and outreach plan, diversion plan, and transition plan

Council Action

- ❑ Provide direction to staff on award of contract;
- ❑ Adopt a resolution awarding a Collection Service Agreement (“CSA”) to GreenWaste Recovery, Inc.; and
- ❑ Authorize the Town Manager to execute and implement the CSA; and
- ❑ Approve maximum service rates, effective October 1, 2017.